Editor’s Note: Since its founding, The New Atlantis has paid close attention to the ethical and political controversies arising from biotechnology—including especially the heated debates over stem cell research. We are pleased to devote the entirety of this issue to a major report on the stem cell debates, a comprehensive and up-to-date account of the scientific facts and the moral, political, and legal stakes. This is the inaugural report of an important new body, the Witherspoon Council on Ethics and the Integrity of Science.

Preface
Robert P. George and Donald W. Landry, Council Co-Chairmen

Members of the Council

REPORT:
The Stem Cell Debates: Lessons for Science and Politics

From Discovery to Debates

Science, Policy, and Politics

The Bush Funding Policy: How Science Informed Ethics and Politics

Ten Common Misrepresentations

1. The Bush administration banned stem cell research. 16
2. Embryonic stem cells are superior to adult stem cells, or adult stem cells are superior to embryonic stem cells. 17
3. Somatic cell nuclear transfer is not cloning and does not produce embryos. 20
4. As a result of the Bush funding policy, the United States fell behind other countries in stem cell research. 24
5. More than 100 million Americans with serious illnesses could be helped with treatments derived from stem cells. 27
6. Therapies relying on stem cells are imminent. 28
7. A clear majority of Americans supports embryonic stem cell research. 29
8. Opposing embryonic stem cell research means opposing cures for suffering people. 30
9. Opposition to embryonic stem cell research is a matter of religious ideology. 31
10. The Bush stem cell funding policy was an illegitimate politicization of science. 32
Case Studies from the Stem Cell Debates 34
Scientific Expertise and Policy—Counting the Stem Cell Lines 34
Politics Distorting the Science—Ron Reagan and the Future of Medicine 36
Selling Cells—California’s Proposition 71 38
Ethical Limits and the Stature of Science—The Case of Paul Berg 39

Lessons of the Stem Cell Debates 41
Science Informs Ethics 42
Ethics Guides Science 42
Science Informs Politics 44
Politics Governs Science 44
The Integrity of Science 47

Beyond the Stem Cell Debates 48

Notes 49

APPENDICES:
A. The Science of Embryonic Stem Cell Research 61
Embryonic Stem Cells: What They Are 61
How Embryonic Stem Cells Are Obtained 63
The Value of Embryonic Stem Cells 67
Alternatives to Embryonic Stem Cells 69
Conclusion 74
Notes to Appendix A 74

B. The Promise of Stem Cell Therapies 82
Autoimmune Diseases 82
Neurological Disorders 85
Cancer 85
Reproductive Applications 86
Regenerative Medicine: Organ and Tissue Repair and Replacement 88
Unapproved Therapies and Stem Cell Tourism 89
Conclusion 90
Notes to Appendix B 91

C. Ethical Considerations Regarding Stem Cell Research 98
Fundamental Moral Claims 99
Sources of Stem Cells: An Ethical Analysis 101
Adult Stem Cells 101
Embryos from IVF Clinics 102
Non-Destructive Embryo Cell Extraction 102
Organismically Dead Embryos 103
Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer (SCNT) 104
Interspecies SCNT 105