

THE NEW ATLANTIS

A JOURNAL OF TECHNOLOGY & SOCIETY

NUMBER 34 ~ WINTER 2012

Editor's Note: Since its founding, *The New Atlantis* has paid close attention to the ethical and political controversies arising from biotechnology—including especially the heated debates over stem cell research. We are pleased to devote the entirety of this issue to a major report on the stem cell debates, a comprehensive and up-to-date account of the scientific facts and the moral, political, and legal stakes. This is the inaugural report of an important new body, the Witherspoon Council on Ethics and the Integrity of Science.

Preface	5
<i>Robert P. George and Donald W. Landry, Council Co-Chairmen</i>	
Members of the Council	7
<i>REPORT:</i>	
The Stem Cell Debates: Lessons for Science and Politics	9
From Discovery to Debates	10
Science, Policy, and Politics	13
The Bush Funding Policy: How Science Informed Ethics and Politics	14
Ten Common Misrepresentations	15
1. <i>The Bush administration banned stem cell research.</i>	16
2. <i>Embryonic stem cells are superior to adult stem cells, or adult stem cells are superior to embryonic stem cells.</i>	17
3. <i>Somatic cell nuclear transfer is not cloning and does not produce embryos.</i>	20
4. <i>As a result of the Bush funding policy, the United States fell behind other countries in stem cell research.</i>	24
5. <i>More than 100 million Americans with serious illnesses could be helped with treatments derived from stem cells.</i>	27
6. <i>Therapies relying on stem cells are imminent.</i>	28
7. <i>A clear majority of Americans supports embryonic stem cell research.</i>	29
8. <i>Opposing embryonic stem cell research means opposing cures for suffering people.</i>	30
9. <i>Opposition to embryonic stem cell research is a matter of religious ideology.</i>	31
10. <i>The Bush stem cell funding policy was an illegitimate politicization of science.</i>	32

Case Studies from the Stem Cell Debates	34
<i>Scientific Expertise and Policy—Counting the Stem Cell Lines</i>	34
<i>Politics Distorting the Science—Ron Reagan and the Future of Medicine</i>	36
<i>Selling Cells—California’s Proposition 71</i>	38
<i>Ethical Limits and the Stature of Science—The Case of Paul Berg</i>	39
Lessons of the Stem Cell Debates	41
<i>Science Informs Ethics</i>	42
<i>Ethics Guides Science</i>	42
<i>Science Informs Politics</i>	44
<i>Politics Governs Science</i>	44
<i>The Integrity of Science</i>	47
Beyond the Stem Cell Debates	48
Notes	49
 <i>APPENDICES:</i>	
A. The Science of Embryonic Stem Cell Research	61
<i>Embryonic Stem Cells: What They Are</i>	61
<i>How Embryonic Stem Cells Are Obtained</i>	63
<i>The Value of Embryonic Stem Cells</i>	67
<i>Alternatives to Embryonic Stem Cells</i>	69
<i>Conclusion</i>	74
<i>Notes to Appendix A</i>	74
B. The Promise of Stem Cell Therapies	82
<i>Autoimmune Diseases</i>	82
<i>Neurological Disorders</i>	85
<i>Cancer</i>	85
<i>Reproductive Applications</i>	86
<i>Regenerative Medicine: Organ and Tissue Repair and Replacement</i>	88
<i>Unapproved Therapies and Stem Cell Tourism</i>	89
<i>Conclusion</i>	90
<i>Notes to Appendix B</i>	91
C. Ethical Considerations Regarding Stem Cell Research	98
<i>Fundamental Moral Claims</i>	99
<i>Sources of Stem Cells: An Ethical Analysis</i>	101
<i>Adult Stem Cells</i>	101
<i>Embryos from IVF Clinics</i>	102
<i>Non-Destructive Embryo Cell Extraction</i>	102
<i>Organismically Dead Embryos</i>	103
<i>Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer (SCNT)</i>	104
<i>Interspecies SCNT</i>	105

Altered Nuclear Transfer (ANT) 106
Embryonic Stem Cell Fusion 107
Induced Pluripotent Stem (iPS) Cells 108
Conclusion 109
Notes to Appendix C 109

D. Stem Cell Research Funding: Policy and Law 114

Policymakers Face the Embryo 114
The Bush Funding Policy 117
Further Policy Developments under President Bush 119
The Obama Funding Policy 120
The Legal Challenge to the Obama Policy 122
Notes to Appendix D 124

E. Overview of International Human Embryonic Stem Cell Laws 129

Australia 129
Canada 130
Chile 131
China 131
Denmark 131
European Union 132
France 132
Germany 133
Iceland 134
India 134
Italy 135
Japan 135
Lithuania 136
The Netherlands 136
Norway 136
Poland 136
Singapore 137
Slovakia 137
Slovenia 138
South Korea 138
Spain 138
Switzerland 139
United Kingdom 139
United Nations 140
Notes to Appendix E 140