

THE NEW ATLANTIS

A JOURNAL OF TECHNOLOGY & SOCIETY

NUMBER 46 ~ SUMMER 2015

Editor's Note: Investigating the moral and political meaning of new technologies has been central to the mission of this journal since its founding, and few new biotechnologies raise such vexing questions as human cloning. With the recent creation of the first cloned human embryos, the implications of human cloning deserve more attention than they have received from policy-makers, the news media, academic bioethicists, and the public at large. And so we devote this entire issue of *The New Atlantis* to a report from the Witherspoon Council on Ethics and the Integrity of Science examining human cloning and making the case against it—whether for the purpose of producing children or for the purpose of biomedical research.

Executive Summary	5
Members of the Council	7

THE THREAT OF HUMAN CLONING

Ethics, Recent Developments, and the Case for Action

Preface: Cloning Then and Now	9
Part 1: Scientific and Historical Background	11
What Is Cloning?	11
Early Cloning Experiments	13
Eugenics and Other Early Ethical Debates	14
Cloning and the Embryo Debates of the 1990s	16
Cloning After Dolly	17
Cloning, Fraudulent and Real	20
Alternatives to Cloning-for-Biomedical-Research	21
Background to the 2013 Cloning Breakthrough	22
Conclusion: Cloning for Science and Reproduction	25
Part 2: The Case Against Cloning-to-Produce-Children	27
Health and Safety	27
Health Problems in Cloned Animals	28

<i>The high death rates of cloned embryos and fetuses.</i>	28
<i>Birth defects and long-term problems.</i>	29
Supposed Benefits of Cloning-to-Produce-Children	30
<i>Cloning to select against bad genes (“negative eugenics”).</i>	30
<i>Cloning to select for good genes (“positive eugenics”).</i>	31
<i>Cloning for “human enhancement.”</i>	32
Cloning as a Source of Genetically Matched Tissues	35
An Unjustifiable Experiment	36
Deeper Moral Issues	38
Repugnance and Its Discontents	39
Motives and Morality	41
Confounded Kinship Relations and the Weight of Expectations	42
Concerns with Manufacturing	45
Conclusion: Two Images of the Family	48
Part 3: The Case Against Cloning-for-Biomedical-Research	51
Exploitation of Embryos	52
Ethics of Egg Procurement	53
Future Prospects	56
<i>Creeping extensions of embryo research.</i>	57
<i>Embryonic and fetal farming.</i>	59
<i>Ectogenesis.</i>	59
<i>Deliberately creating headless babies.</i>	60
<i>Interspecies cloning.</i>	61
<i>Artificial gametes.</i>	62
<i>Genetically engineered children.</i>	63
Alternatives to Cloning-for-Biomedical-Research	65
<i>Supposed advantages of cloning.</i>	66
<i>Advantages of iPS cells over cloned stem cells.</i>	66
<i>Do we need to pursue both lines of research?</i>	67
<i>Altered nuclear transfer.</i>	69
<i>Are embryonic stem cells a “gold standard”?</i>	71
Conclusion: Scientific Research and the Need for Ethics	73
Part 4: Cloning Policy in the United States	74
Congressional Cloning Legislation	74
Embryo Research and Federal Funding	78
Regulation of Egg Collection	80
State Policies Related to Cloning	80
Cloning and the Constitution	81
<i>Regulating commerce.</i>	82
<i>Conditional funding.</i>	83

<i>Intellectual property.</i>	84
<i>Equal protection.</i>	85
Potential Constitutional Challenges to a National Cloning Prohibition	86
<i>Would prohibiting cloning violate a right to “reproductive freedom”?</i>	86
<i>Would prohibiting human cloning infringe on the “right of scientific inquiry”?</i>	88
The Moratorium Option and Its Flaws	89
Conclusion: Cloning Policy	89

Part 5: Recommendations **91**

- I. Congress Should Prohibit All Forms of Human Cloning and the Creation of Embryos for Research 91
- II. States Should Also Prohibit Human Cloning and the Creation of Embryos for Research 93

APPENDIX:

State Laws on Human Cloning	95
------------------------------------	-----------

Notes	107
--------------	------------